

**GST BOCES Copier RFP for Horseheads Central School District
12/21/12**

I recommend Eastern MPN based on the following analysis. While Xerox appears to be a few dollars cheaper, they do not meet some critical criteria that were stated in the RFP. Other than Eastern MPN, all responders fall short in some of the criteria items. These points are highlighted.

Thank you.

**Gregg Moyer
Technology Director
Horseheads Central School District**

Eastern MPN

Criteria

13 technicians – strongest support depth.

Memory minimum satisfied.

Hard Drive minimum satisfied.

2 and 3 hole punch available at same time.

3 model types regarding toner management.

B/W and Color toner replacement is automatic.

Finishing, scanning, stapling, and faxing minimums satisfied.

Short duration specified to implement.

Security features and system management features available.

Software recommended is same as being utilized by several districts in the region.

Managed services available for HP printer fleet thru software.

Lowest B/W cpp.

References - Mixture of Business and Education – 5 provided; 3 are school districts (3 school districts preferred).

PaperCut Software solution specified.

Costs

5 year Lease	\$5,550/Mo.
B/W CPP	\$.0039 (this includes B/W printed on the color copiers)
Color CPP	\$.051
Based on 982,000/Mo.	\$3,829.80/Mo. (based on B/W .0039)
Special Software and hardware	\$979/Mo.
Total	\$10,358.80/Mo.

Twin Tiers Imaging Systems

Criteria

4 technicians.

Does not meet minimum Memory.

Does not meet minimum Hard Drive.

Does not meet minimum for Hi-Speed copier speed.

B/W and Color toner replacement is automatic.

Can't tell if 2 & 3 hole punch provided – Spec sheet states multi-position, Summary Sheet says Yes.

4 model types regarding toner management.

Does not allow Duplex print default.

5-8 weeks to implement.

Special software embedded in lease and not provided separately.

References - Mixture of Business and Education – 5 provided; 2 are school districts (3 school districts preferred)

Highest B/W cpp.

PaperCut Software solution specified.

Costs

5 year Lease	\$6,478.99/Mo.
B/W CPP	\$.005 (this includes B/W printed on the color copiers)
Color CPP	\$.05
Based on 982,000/Mo.	\$4,910/Mo. (based on B/W .005)
Special Software and hardware	\$220.58/Mo. (Proximity card readers)
Total	\$11,609.57/Mo.

Xerox

Criteria

7 technicians.

Does not meet minimum response time within 4 hours; provides a range of 4 -8 hours for Office locations.

Does not meet minimum Hard Drive, particularly on HS central copiers.

Stock needs reviewed once per month, but this can be adjusted. Not sure if this allows for Spares On-Site inventory, but assume it can be negotiated. Surplus toner is essential.

B/W toner replacement is automatic; Color toner replacement is not automatic.

4 model types regarding toner management.

Cloning of copier settings is not provided.

24 (B/W) of 41 copiers do not have scan-to or print-from USB capability.

24 units cannot 2 and 3 hole punch (one kit in the machine at a time).

"Managed print services" for HP LaserJet fleet not included.

References - Mixture of Business and Education – 3 provided, 2 academic – 1 college, 1 school district (3 school districts preferred).

PCounter Software solution specified.

Costs

5 year Lease	15 @ \$135.98 = \$2,039.70/Mo.
	22 @ \$108.97 = \$2,397.34/Mo.
	2 @ \$110.88 = \$221.76/Mo.
	2 @ @426.04 = \$852.08/Mo.
	\$5,510.88/Mo.

B/W CPP	\$.0049 (this does NOT include B/W printed on the color copiers)
B/W CPP color copier	\$.0059
B/W CPP Hi Speed copier	\$.0039
Color CPP	\$.049
982,000/Mo.	

B/W CPP	60% or 589,200 @ \$.0049 = \$2,887.08
B/W CPP color copier	10% or 98,200 @ \$.0059 = \$579.38
B/W CPP Hi Speed copier	30% or 294,600 @ \$.0039 = \$1,148.94
Based on 982,000/Mo.	\$4,615.40/Mo.

Special Software and hardware \$205.25/Mo. (\$2,463 annually)

Total \$10,331.53/Mo.

RICOH USA

Criteria

12 technicians.

Does not meet minimum Memory, Had to review individual Spec sheets for all four models being considered.

Does not meet minimum Hard Drive on 13 of 41 copiers.

B/W and Color toner replacement is automatic.

4 model types regarding toner management.

Finishing, scanning, stapling, and faxing minimums satisfied.

Permanent Replacement language - Arrangements for replacement equipment will be made when it is determined original equipment cannot be repaired." This is ambiguous and potentially increases down time.

References - Education – 4 provided; 4 are school districts (3 school districts preferred).

Highest B/W cpp.

Equitrac Express Software solution specified.

Costs

5 year Lease	\$5,838.31/Mo.
B/W CPP	\$.005 (this includes B/W printed on the color copiers)
B/W CPP Hi Speed	\$.0038
Color CPP	\$.045
Based on 982,000/Mo.	\$4,550/Mo. (based on B/W .005 and .0038 combination)
Special Software and hardware	\$557.72/Mo.
Total	\$10,946.03/Mo.